



Consultation on change in governance of the Fire and Rescue Service

Police and Crime Panel update

14th September 2017 (submitted 5th September 2017)

Summary of approach

- 1,500 random, statistically representative face-to-face surveys, avoiding the risk of ‘self-selecting’ bias (undertaken by independent research company)
- Online and hardcopy ‘self-selecting’ survey that can be benchmarked against the random survey
- Workforce survey – police and fire
- Stakeholder survey and focus groups
- 8 x public outreach events – 1 in each district/borough and York
- Visits to fire stations and fire HQ

The public and the workforce have been the focus of the consultation from the outset. Fire and policing are their public surveys, paid for via local precepting, and so there ensuring their voice is heard is paramount.

Overview of the statistically representative, face-to-face survey

An independent market research company, MEL, were appointed via an open tender exercise to undertake the 1,500 strong statistically representative survey. MEL also advised on the design of the survey itself, which was subsequently used for the other surveys (with some specific questions on the internal surveys).

This part of the consultation is pivotal as it gives a scientifically sound evidence base for the views from North Yorkshire residents. To explain the rationale for the above, please see the below extract from MEL’s proposal below. The extract also details how many residents from each district were included in this part of the consultation, as well as age ranges:

EXTRACT FROM SUCCESSFUL BID

ITEM 9

While the online survey, coupled with our range of alternative completion methods, will provide **anybody** with an opportunity to participate and give their views, these methods are self-selective. They therefore suffer from self-selection bias – it is typically only those who hold very strong views to proposals (whether positive or negative) that choose to participate. These participants will generally be unrepresentative of the wider population.

We therefore recommend that personal interviews are conducted with households across North Yorkshire so that a representative view can be obtained. To do this we would undertake a stratified random sampling approach and the sample will be drawn from Royal Mail's Postcode Address File (PAF), which contains a list of all households in an area. The sampling points in which interviews are completed are based on Census Output Areas (OAs). First of all, a list containing all of the OAs in North Yorkshire is stratified by each of the seven local authority Districts/Boroughs and by City of York UA.

The table below shows the population of North Yorkshire, using 2011 Census data. To achieve a robust sample with ± 3.0 confidence interval, then 1,070 interviews would be required. The table also shows the number of interviews that would be required if a representative quota was set for each District/Borough.

Local Authority	Adult (18+) population*	% of North Yorkshire	Representative sample
Craven	44,767	7%	105
Hambleton	71,916	11%	168
Harrogate	124,904	19%	292
Richmondshire	41,493	6%	97
Ryedale	41,741	7%	97
Scarborough	88,863	14%	208
Selby	65,968	10%	154
York	162,096	25%	379
Totals	641,748	100%	1,500
Confidence intervals (95% level)			$\pm 2.53\%$

* Source: 2011 Census

Using an equal interval sampling approach (every 'n'th record), a number of OAs (i.e. sampling points) are selected in which to sample, proportional to the known profile of the area (e.g. 2011 Census data) and will therefore **cover both urban and rural areas**. For example, in order to complete 105 interviews in Craven, 11 OAs (sampling points) are selected, and in each of which, around 10 interviews are completed.

Other quotas would be discussed and agreed with you, such as gender, age bands, ethnicity, etc, during the inception meeting, but the table below shows the proportion of residents that would be interviewed in each District/Borough by age band as an example.

ITEM 9

Local authority	18 to 24	25 to 34	35 to 44	45 to 54	55 to 64	65+	TOTAL	%
Craven	8	11	17	20	20	30	105	7%
Hambleton	15	19	26	32	30	45	168	11%
Harrogate	25	39	52	56	48	72	292	19%
Richmondshire	14	15	15	16	15	21	97	6%
Ryedale	8	10	15	18	19	28	97	6%
Scarborough	21	24	29	37	38	59	208	14%
Selby	15	20	28	31	27	33	154	10%
York UA	65	62	61	60	52	78	379	25%
TOTAL	170	199	244	271	249	366	1,500	100%
% of total	11%	13%	16%	18%	17%	24%		

While the above tables demonstrate how we would target particular groups to ensure a broadly representative sample is achieved, where necessary, the final achieved data will be weighted to ensure it is fully representative of North Yorkshire.

Summary of results to date

To impact on the consultation as minimally as is possible, the Commissioner has thus far only shared summary figures from the completed face-to-face surveys at local authority meetings as that part of the consultation can no longer be affected. Those figures are below.

For clarity, the face-to-face survey was undertaken by MEL employees, not by OPCC staff. The interviews were conducted on random doorsteps across the county and city by MEL employees, and were on a 1-2-1 basis. The geographic and demographic breakdown is as per the above extract from MEL's proposal.

Statistically representative survey

- Option 1 – representation: 22%
- **Option 2 – governance: 61%**
- Option 3 – single employer: 17%

The Commissioner is committed to transparency and openness and will of course publish all the results of the consultation once it has been completed, and a consultation summary will form part of the business case which is subsequently sent to the Home Secretary.